

1072 (paf)
LORD, C.
1978

DAMON

HERMES

UNIVERSITEIT
BIBLIOTHECA
AMSTERDAM

ZEITSCHRIFT FÜR KLASSISCHE PHILOLOGIE

HERAUSGEGEBEN VON

JOCHEN BLEICKEN

KARL BÜCHNER · HANS DILLER †

106. BAND · 1978 · HEFT 1

1. QUARTAL

Lord C

28 notes Music

Damon Atheniensis. — Lord C., On Damon and music education : Hermes
CVI 1978 32-43. | Untersuchungen zur Lehre des Damon auf Grund des
Berichtes im zweiten Buch des Aristides Quintilianus und bei Aristoteles
(Politika 1342b 17-34). Die Positionen von Damon und Aristoxenos einerseits
und Plato und Aristoteles andererseits werden deutlich gemacht. [1405

Hermes
106 (1978) 1

W563



FRANZ STEINER VERLAG GMBH · WIESBADEN

ON DAMON AND MUSIC EDUCATION

Very little is reliably known of the musical doctrines of that enigmatic figure — the teacher of Pericles and Socrates — Damon of Athens, and of the school which appears to have descended from him¹. In the virtual absence of direct testimony, it has been customary to rely on what are thought to be the wholesale borrowings from Damon embodied in the discussion of music education in the third book of Plato's *Republic*. Not long ago we were exposed to the opinion that everything of interest in that discussion, and in particular the Platonic doctrine of poetic imitation, is borrowed from or inspired by Damon — or Damon in company with »the Pythagoreans«². It is safer and, I believe, ultimately more profitable to begin by assuming that Plato never simply »borrowed« anything, and to wonder whether the authentic teaching of Damon on the subject of music education was not rather different than the argument of the *Republic* might seem to suggest. That a fresh approach in this matter is necessary has indeed been felt³; that one is possible I hope to show. My investigation will concentrate on two pieces of evidence — one neglected and inadequately exploited, the other entirely overlooked: the brief account of Damon and his school in the second book of Aristides Quintilianus, and the interpolated section at the end of the eighth book of Aristotle's *Politics*.

The most important — indeed, the only — extended account of the teaching of the Damonian school occurs in the musical treatise of Aristides Quintilianus. Whether or to what extent Aristides has incorporated authentic Damonian material in his own teaching is not a question that can be settled here, though it is fair to say that scholars have not always shown the proper caution in this respect⁴. But Aristides' one explicit reference to Damon is of unusual interest, and it has not, I believe, been properly understood — largely because (as so frequently happens in cases of this kind) the Damonian »fragment« has been isolated from the context which determines its meaning.

¹ For Damon's life and political activities see A. E. RAUBITSCHKE, Damon, *Cl. Med.* 16, 1955, 78—83; F. SCHACHERMEYER, Damon, *Beiträge zur Alten Geschichte und deren Nachleben: Festschrift für Franz Altheim*, Berlin 1969, I 192—204.

² H. KOLLER, *Die Mimesis in der Antike*, Bern 1954. KOLLER's thesis continues to find favor in some quarters (e. g. H. JOHN, *Das musikerzieherische Wirken Pythagoras' und Damons*, *Das Altertum*, 8, 1962, 69), despite an effective refutation by G. F. ELSE, *Imitation in the Fifth Century*, *CP* 53, 1958, 73 ff.

³ W. ANDERSON, *The Importance of Damonian Theory in Plato's Thought*, *TAPA* 86, 1955, 88—102; *Ethos and Education in Greek Music*, Cambridge, Mass. 1966, 74—81.

⁴ See H. DEITERS, *De Aristeidis Quintiliani fontibus*, Dürer 1870, 13 ff.; K. VON JAN, Damon, *RE* IV 2073; R. SCHÄFKE, *Aristeides Quintilianus Von der Musik*, Berlin 1937, 100—112; KOLLER 79—81; ANDERSON, *Damonian Theory*, 98 ff.; cf. ELSE 85 and nn. 53 and 54. Not much progress will be made in resolving this question until Aristides' own teaching — which is not only obscure, but voluntarily obscure (consider *De mus.* 2, 7, [65, 10—21 WINNINGTON-INGRAM]) — is better understood.

The argument of the relevant section of *De musica* II is as follows. Just as individual notes have a definite character (ἦθος) — some are »male«, others »female«, and others neutral or mixed (2 12 [77, 19—20 WINNINGTON-INGRAM]) — so too do intervals and entire harmonies. Accordingly, one may use the harmonies »by applying them to different kinds of souls by way of similarity or by way of opposition; thus you will uncover a weak character that is hidden and heal it and make it better, and you will effect persuasion: if the character is mean or harsh, you lead it through a middle state to its opposite, and if fine and good, you augment it by similarity to a settled and balanced condition« (ἡ καθ' ὁμοιότητα ἐκάστη ψυχῇ προσφέρων ἁρμονίαν ἢ κατ' ἐναντιότητα, τό τε φαῦλον ὑποικουροῦν ἦθος ἐκκαλύψεις καὶ ἰάση καὶ βέλτιον ἐνθήσεις, καὶ πειθῶ ποιήσεις, εἰ μὲν ἀγεννὲς ἢ σκληρὸν ὑπείη, διὰ μεσότητος ἄγων ἐς τοῦναντίον, εἰ δ' ἀστεῖον καὶ χρηστόν, δι' ὁμοιότητος αὖζων ἐς σύμμετρον) (14 [80, 11—16]). Aristides' argument presupposes his distinction between two sorts of »character education« (ἡθικὴ παιδείσιν) effected by music: a »therapeutic« education operating »by way of opposition« (κατ' ἐναντιότητα) on those who suffer from an excess of passion, and an »opheletic« education operating »by way of similarity« (καθ' ὁμοιότητα, δι' ὁμοιότητος) on those who are sufficiently free from passion to lend themselves to the »persuasion« which music is able to effect, or whose character is susceptible of being »assimilated« to the ethos a particular kind of music imitates or embodies⁵. After a brief remark concerning the diagnostic testing of character by different harmonies, Aristides proceeds as follows:

»For the harmonies resemble, as I said, their dominant intervals and limiting notes, and these resemble the movements and passions of the soul. That the notes even of a continuous melody form by similarity a character that did not exist previously both in the young and in those already advanced in years and develop one that is latent was made clear by Damon and his school as well. In the harmonies handed down by him, at any rate, one will find that of the notes employed the female and the male at one time or another either dominate or are used more sparingly or not at all — clearly because a harmony too is beneficial according to the character of each kind of soul. It is for this reason that of the elements of musical composition 'note-selection' is regarded as in each case the most useful in the choice of the most necessary notes« [Ἐοί-
κασιν γάρ, ὥς ἔφην, αἱ μὲν ἁρμονίαι τοῖς πλεονάζουσι διαστήμασιν ἢ
τοῖς περιέχουσι φθόγγοις, οὗτοι δὲ τοῖς τῆς ψυχῆς κινήμασιν τε καὶ

⁵ De mus. 2, 9 (68, 22—69, 1); for the distinction πάθος-πειθῶ consider especially 2, 6 (59, 27—28) and context. In the passage cited above, WINNINGTON-INGRAM wrongly marks a period after ἐνθήσεις (80, 14): καθ' ὁμοιότητα | κατ' ἐναντιότητα stands in chiasmic relation with τό τε φαῦλον . . . ἐνθήσεις | καὶ πειθῶ ποιήσεις, while εἰ μὲν . . . σύμμετρον (80, 14—16) only further elaborates the same distinction.

παθήμασιν. ὅτι γὰρ δι' ὁμοιότητος οἱ φθόγγοι καὶ συνεχοῦς μελωδίας πλάττουσί τε οὐκ ὄν ἦθος ἐν τε παισὶ καὶ τοῖς ἤδη προβεβηκόσι καὶ ἐνδομυχοῦν ἐξάγουσιν, ἐδήλουν καὶ οἱ περὶ Δάμωνα· ἐν γοῦν ταῖς ὑπ' αὐτοῦ παραδεδομέναις ἀρμονίαις τῶν φερομένων φθόγγων ὅτε μὲν τοὺς θήλεις, ὅτε δὲ τοὺς ἄρρενας ἔστιν εὐρεῖν ἥτοι πλεονάζοντας ἢ ἐπ' ἔλαττον ἢ οὐδ' ὅλως παρειλημμένους, δῆλον ὡς κατὰ τὸ ἦθος ψυχῆς ἐκάστης καὶ ἀρμονίας χρησιμευούσης. διὸ καὶ τῶν μερῶν τῆς μελοποιίας ἡ καλουμένη πεττεία τὸ χρησιμώτατον ἐν ἐκλογῇ τῶν ἀναγκαιοτάτων φθόγγων ἐκάστοτε θεωρουμένη] (I4 [80, 23—81, 6] = Damon fr. 37 B 7 DIELS-KRANZ).

This passage is of interest in the first place not so much for what Aristides says as for what he fails to say about the doctrines of the Damonian school. If Aristides' remark is read in its context, it becomes clear that the agreement between the Damonian teaching and Aristides' own views is at best a partial one. According to Aristides, music can affect character either »by way of similarity« or »by way of opposition«; according to Damon (and there is no reason to suppose Aristides is not fully reporting the Damonian position), music affects character »by way of similarity« only⁶. For Aristides, music can both form the character and heal the passions. For Damon, as it seems, the ethical or educational effect of music is limited to the formation of character. What is more, music education as understood by the Damonian school is operative only in certain periods of life. For Aristides attributes to the school of Damon a concern for the music education not of the young and »those more advanced in years« — as is often assumed — but rather of the young and »those *already* advanced in years« (τοῖς ἤδη προβεβηκόσι)⁷: for Damon, music education is the education on the one hand of children, and on the other of *old men*. While Aristides regards as an integral and important part of music education the healing of excessive passion in mature men, Damon had limited music education to the formation of character in the young and the old.

The only obstacle in the way of understanding the Damonian teaching in the manner indicated by Aristides is a story appearing in several late writers, to the effect that several young men indulging in drunken behavior to an accompaniment of Phrygian music were brought to order when Damon instructed the flute firl to play a Dorian tune⁸. But since the same or a similar incident is connected more frequently and on better authority with the name

⁶ Consider Athenaeus 628c = Damon fr. 37 B6 DIELS-KRANZ, Plato Rep. 401d1. Cf. ELSE 83—85.

⁷ Cf. De mus. 2, 4 (58, 3—5). This mistake is made by ANDERSON, Ethos 39, JAN 2072—2073 and F. LASSERRE, Plutarque De la Musique, Olten/Lausanne 1954, 58; SCHÄPFKE correctly translates »Menschen vorgerückten Alters« (289).

⁸ Galen. De plac. Hipp. et Plat. V 453 MÜLLER, Martianus Capella 9, 926 = Damon fr. 37 A8 DIELS — KRANZ. Cf. LASSERRE 62—64, SCHACHERMEYR 199.

of Pythagoras⁹, and since the Pythagoreans were indeed concerned with the healing or »purification« (κάθαρσις) of the passions by means of music, there is no good reason to credit the attribution of this story to Damon¹⁰. As regards the Damonian concern — at first sight so implausible — with a music education for old men, the evidence which confirms it will be discussed in a moment.

What must be noticed next in Aristides' account of the Damonian teaching is its intention. Aristides appeals to the authority of Damon not so much in order to support his view of the ethical effect of music »by way of similarity« as to support his view of the ethical effect of a harmony (or a harmony as realized in a »continuous melody«) as distinguished from its notes or intervals. Aristides' appeal to Damon reflects the musical situation of his own time: it reflects the attenuation of genuine modal ethos which had begun as early as the fifth century B. C., and which eventually permitted the amalgamation of the ancient harmonies in the uniform scale (the so-called Greater Perfect System) of classical music theory. The »harmonies« presupposed in Aristides' analysis are not true ἁρμονίαι — distinctive scales or »tunings« and the musical idioms associated with them — but »octave-species« (εἶδη) distinguished from one another only by their relative position on a single scale. Since, at least in theory, many harmonies share many of the same notes, it is not evident that the character of a given melody will be decisively affected by the harmony in which it is composed.

Aristides' solution to this difficulty is twofold. In the first place, he argues that a harmony derives its distinctive ethos from the notes which belong to it — from the »limiting notes« which define its range¹¹ and from the notes determining the intervals between them. Secondly, he stresses the importance of »note selection« (περτεία) in musical composition (cf. I, 12 [29, 18—21]). The ethical effect of a given harmony depends, as it seems, on a selective use of the notes belonging to that harmony: only the notes which are »most necessary« in creating that effect are to be employed — for every harmony will necessarily contain notes which conflict with its dominant ethos.

⁹ Philodemus De mus. Pap. Herc. 1576 fr. 1, 16—19 (58) KEMKE; Cicero fr. 2 ORELLI; Quintilian 1, 10, 32, Sextus Empiricus Adv. math. 6, 8; Iamblichus Vit. Pyth. 112 DEUBNER; Boethius De mus. 1, 1.

¹⁰ Aristoxenus fr. 26 WEHRLI, Iamblichus Vit. Pyth. 64 DEUBNER, Aristides De mus. 2, 19 (91, 27—31). It is frequently asserted that Damon was himself a Pythagorean, but the only evidence is a questionable scholion to Plato Alc. 118c (= Damon fr. 37A2 DIELS-KRANZ). That Damon was influenced in some degree by Pythagoreanism is possible and even likely; that such influence cannot account for Damon's theorizing on music education is suggested by the fact that while Aristoxenus testifies (fr. 35 WEHRLI) to a Pythagorean concern for public education, he conspicuously fails to connect it with the Pythagorean concern for music.

¹¹ This seems to be the meaning of τοῖς περιέχουσι φθόγγοις at 81, 24 (cf. SCHÄPFKE 289 n. 4, JAN 2072).

It is sometimes assumed on the basis of this passage that the notion that individual notes have a distinct ethos (and the related emphasis on the importance of »note selection«) is Damonian in origin¹². Aristides' argument seems to me to suggest quite the opposite. The »harmonies« of the time of Damon were true modes rather than segments of a uniform scale; as Aristides himself points out, in very ancient times (the context is a discussion of the modes mentioned in Plato's *Republic*) »they did not always use all the notes« which might seem properly to belong to a particular harmony (I, 9 [18, 5 ff.]). »Note selection« cannot have been a principle of Damonian theory, for it was guaranteed by the very nature of modal composition. As regards the distinction between »male« and »female« notes, it appears to represent Aristides' interpretation of the »harmonies« of Damon rather than a genuine Damonian doctrine (consider 80, 29 γούν, 81, 1 ἔστιν εὐρεῖν): it is more than likely that modal ethos was regarded by Damon and his school (and by any musically educated person of the fifth century) as determined less by individual notes abstractly considered than by certain types of intervals and the musical idioms or styles which had developed around them¹³.

When Aristides speaks of »the harmonies handed down« by Damon, he is evidently speaking not of musical modes proper (or of a written composition) but of melodic exercises of a certain kind — »Vokaletüden«¹⁴. When he goes on to conclude that the male or the female notes are dominant in these exercises »because a harmony too is beneficial according to the character of each kind of soul«, ἁρμονία has its normal meaning¹⁵ — since the whole point of Aristides' argument is to establish the ethical distinctiveness of a mode or harmony in its normal sense. The suppressed premise of Aristides' rather elliptical remark is that the Damonian »exercises« are — as their name suggests — compositions designed to embody the characteristic ethical effects of different harmonies. Accordingly, it is wrong to assume that Aristides imputes to Damon or his school the practice of composing individualized melodies for the benefit of »each individual soul« (ψυχῇ ἐκάστη)¹⁶. Whatever may have been Aristides' own view in this matter, his account of Damonian education mentions human groups or types (the young and the old) rather than individuals; and his interpretation of the Damonian »harmonies« suggests two distinct types (those dominated by male notes and those dominated by female notes) rather than

¹² JAN 2073, ANDERSON, Damonian Theory 98—101, LASSERRE 58—59.

¹³ Cf. Aristoxenus Harm. 23. 39. In Aristides' version of the scales mentioned in the *Republic* (I, 9 [18—20]), the initial »limiting note« is in many cases the same. Cf. ANDERSON, Ethos 11—19; I. HENDERSON, Ancient Greek Music, The New Oxford History of Music I, London 1957, 345—349.

¹⁴ Cf. SCHÄFKE 289 n. 7.

¹⁵ Contrary to what ANDERSON seems to suggest (Damonian Theory 99 n. 33).

¹⁶ Thus ANDERSON, Ethos 41 (but cf. Damonian Theory 99).

a continuum which could accommodate slight variations in musical ethos to accord with the individual needs of a variety of human characters. What may be inferred from Aristides' account, I think, is that the harmonic exercises associated with the name of Damon — exercises, it would seem, which had originally been designed for use in education (and primarily, one would suppose, in the education of the young) — were composed in two distinct and even radically different modes or types of modes. Which modes these were, and what was their intended effect, we will now try to determine.

That Damon had recommended for the purposes of education two modes differing widely in ethos will be granted by those who regard Plato's treatment of music education as decisive for the Damonian view. It appears to have been a special claim of the Damonian school that music is capable of fostering all the virtues — »not only courage and moderation, but justice as well« (Philodemus *De mus.* 1, 13 [7] KEMKE = fr. 37 B4 DIELS-KRANZ); and when Plato emphasizes the need for two harmonies of an opposing character to foster the opposing virtues of courage and moderation (*Rep.* 399a–c), it is likely that he is reflecting something of Damon's own teaching in this matter. Similarly, he distinguishes in the *Laws* (802e) — a passage which may well be the source of Aristides' theory — between a »male« music which is »magnificent and disposes to courage« and a »female« music which »inclines rather to the orderly and moderate«. Now the solution that Plato appears to adopt in the *Republic* — the Dorian mode is required in order to promote courage, the Phrygian in order to promote moderation — is generally assumed to represent the view of Damon¹⁷. But, in the first place, such a view is in itself highly problematic: the Phrygian mode was normally understood to produce feelings of »enthusiasm« or religious exaltation, or the very opposite of »moderation« (σωφροσύνη) in one of its senses¹⁸. In the second place, it is not even certain that this was in fact the Platonic position. The argument of the *Republic* is decidedly ambiguous, and already in antiquity there was some disagreement as to which mode Plato had meant to connect with which virtue¹⁹. Several

¹⁷ Thus H. ABERT, *Die Lehre vom Ethos in der griechischen Musik*, Leipzig 1899, 84–86; LASSERRE 62; JOHN 70; ANDERSON, *Ethos* 72–73, 107–109.

¹⁸ Consider Euripides *Bacch.* 159 and context, Aristotle *Pol.* 1340b 4–5; 1342a 32–b6.

¹⁹ Proclus *In Remp.* I 61, 24–28 KROLL. Though the question cannot be fully discussed here, I am inclined to agree with the ancient Platonists who identified Phrygian as the warlike and Dorian as the pacific mode. The problem of the Homeric hero as it is adumbrated in *Republic* II–III is that his reasoned beliefs regarding the gods render him afraid of death and hence deficient in courage; Phrygian music, by its very »irrationalism«, overcomes these scruples and thereby promotes courage. It is too often forgotten (consider the argument of LASSERRE, 62) that the Phrygian »songs of Olympus« are described by Plato in much the same terms as they are by Aristotle (compare *Symp.* 215 b7–d6 and *Minos* 318b with *Pol.* 1340a8–12, 1342a7–11; cf. Proclus *In Remp.* I 62, 5–9 KROLL).

ancient commentators seem to have thought that, despite appearances, Plato recognized only the Dorian mode as being suited to the education of the young²⁰.

In the treatise *On Music* formerly attributed to Plutarch, we are told that »the relaxed [ἐπανειμένη] Lydian mode — the one that is opposite to Mixed Lydian and resembles Ionian — is said to have been invented by Damon of Athens« (De mus. 1136d = fr. 37 B5 DIELS-KRANZ). Not much has been made of this remark, partly because the authority of the Pseudo-Plutarch is worth little in itself, partly because an interest in Lydian music on the part of Damon appears to be ruled out by Plato's explicit rejection of the Lydian modes for the purposes of education (Rep. 398e). In its context, however, the remark is a suggestive one. It is preceded by a brief discussion of the Mixed Lydian mode, and immediately followed by this statement:

»Of these harmonies, then, one is mournful and the other relaxed [ἐκλελυμένης], and it was with reason that Plato rejected them and chose Dorian as being suited to warlike and moderate men — though not, by Zeus, as Aristoxenus says in the second book of his *Musicians*, because he was unaware that in these too there is something useful for a regime of guardians« [De mus. 1136e = Aristoxenus fr. 82 WEHRLI].

Evidently, Aristoxenus had criticized Plato's treatment of the ethos of the various harmonies on the grounds that the Lydian modes which Plato had summarily rejected also possess a certain educative value. Now it is possible that this understanding of Lydian music was original with Aristoxenus. But the very fact — if it is a fact — that one of the Lydian harmonies was invented by the leading theorist of music education would suggest that an educative value had been recognized in Lydian music before the time of Aristoxenus — by Damon. Even if the story preserved by the Pseudo-Plutarch is not true, it may well reflect a special position accorded the relaxed Lydian mode (or Lydian music as a whole) in the theories of the Damonian school.

In the final chapter of Book VIII of the *Politics*, Aristotle makes use of a distinction between harmonies or types of tunes according to which there are tunes which represent or affect character (τὰ ἠθικά), tunes which represent or affect action (τὰ πρακτικά), and tunes which represent or induce religious exaltation (τὰ ἐνθουσιαστικά). A similar distinction seems to be implied in a passage in the *Problems* (19, 48. 922b10—27) dealing with the harmonies employed in the music of tragedy. If one supplements Aristotle's brief remarks concerning the character of the various harmonies with the evidence of the *Problems*, the result is as follows. To the category of »enthusiastic« tunes cor-

²⁰ This is the argument of Proclus (In Remp. I 61, 28—62, 28), who appeals to the implicit characterization of Phrygian music in the *Minos* (see last note) and, less cogently, to Lach. 188d; and it is evidently assumed in [Plutarch] De mus. 1136e—a passage which is clearly influenced by Aristoxenus.

responds the Phrygian harmony; to that of »practical« tunes, the Hypophrygian (Ionian) and Hypodorian (Aeolian) harmonies; and to that of »ethical« tunes, the Dorian harmony as well as the various harmonies of the Lydian group²¹.

Aristotle attributes the classification employed in the *Politics* to »certain men engaged in philosophy« who are »familiar with the education concerning music«. That Aristoxenus in particular is meant has often been assumed. The identification is correct, I think, for it is confirmed by the report of Aristoxenus' views provided by the Pseudo-Plutarch: Aristoxenus had attacked the treatment of music education in the *Republic* precisely on the grounds that Plato had been unaware of the (moral or civic) utility of certain of the Lydian harmonies. Evidently, Aristoxenus considered the Lydian harmonies as in some measure »ethical« or educative — though perhaps not as much or as generally so as the »most ethical« Dorian (cf. Pol. 1342a2—3. 28—30). And Aristotle only makes explicit what is implicit in Aristoxenus' distinction between »ethical« and »enthusiastic« harmonies when he criticizes Plato or his Socrates for admitting the Phrygian as well as the Dorian harmony in the education of the young (Pol. 1342a32—b36)²².

If it is granted that the classification of harmonies appearing in Aristotle's *Politics* and in the *Problems* bears the stamp of Aristoxenus, it is surely a plausible assumption that Aristoxenus' views in these matters were influenced in some degree by the school of Damon. That this was in fact the case is shown, I think, by what I will suggest is an unrecognized document of the Damonian school — the interpolated paragraph which concludes Book VIII of the *Politics*.

The last paragraph of the *Politics* reads as follows:

»There are two things to be kept in view, the possible and the fitting; individuals ought rather to undertake what is possible and fitting for

²¹ For the text and interpretation of Problems 19, 48 see my article: A Peripatetic Account of Tragic Music, *Hermes* 105/2, 175—179. My conclusions as to the categorization of the various harmonies agree essentially with those of ABERT (96—97), except that he understands relaxed Lydian as an enthusiastic harmony (cf. F. SUSEMIHL and R. HICKS, *The Politics of Aristotle*, London 1894, 630—631).

²² Aristotle's third category is also of interest in this connection. When the Pseudo-Plutarch undertakes to defend Plato against the strictures of Aristoxenus, he defends Plato's understanding of the ethical effect not only of the Lydian modes but of Aeolian and Ionian as well — *ἡπίστατο γὰρ ὅτι ἡ τραγῳδία (καὶ) ταύτῃ τῇ μελοποιίᾳ κέχρηται* (De mus. 1136e = Aristoxenus fr. 82 [30, 30—32] WEHRLI). Plato had treated Ionian as a relaxed or »sympotic« mode (Rep. 398e6—10); Aristoxenus seems to have disputed this characterization on the grounds that Ionian was used in tragedy. Aristoxenus' view reappears in Problems 19, 48, where the »practical« Hypodorian (Aeolian) and Hypophrygian (Ionian) are said to be the modes appropriate to the heroes of tragedy; and it is evidently presupposed by Heraclides Ponticus (fr. 163 WEHRLI = Athenaeus 14, 624c and 625b), who describes the Ionian mode as being, among other things, *τῇ τραγῳδίᾳ προσφιλέως*. The most extended discussion of the ethos of both modes is that of Heraclides; it is perhaps less idiosyncratic than is usually thought.

them. But these things too are defined according to the period of life. For example, those who are enfeebled by age have difficulty singing the high-strung harmonies, and nature directs them to use the relaxed ones. For this reason some of those connected with music have rightly blamed Socrates in this matter too, because he rejected the use of the relaxed harmonies in education on the grounds that they have an effect similar to that produced by drink — an effect not of actual drunkenness (for drunkenness is properly a state of excited frenzy) but rather one of stupor. So one ought to become familiar with harmonies and tunes of this sort with a view to a period of life that is to come — that is to say, old age; and also in the event that one of these harmonies is such as to be fitting for the period of youth by the fact that it promotes orderliness while affording amusement — as appears to be the case with the Lydian harmony above all. It is clear that three standards are to be observed in education: the mean, the possible and the fitting». [εἰσὶ δὲ δύο σκοποί, τό τε δυνατόν καὶ τὸ πρέπον· καὶ γὰρ τὰ δυνατὰ δεῖ μεταχειρίζεσθαι μᾶλλον καὶ τὰ πρέποντα ἐκάστους. ἔστι δὲ καὶ ταῦτα ὠρισμένα ταῖς ἡλικίαις, οἷον τοῖς ἀπειρηκόσι διὰ χρόνον οὐ ῥᾶδιον ἄδειν τὰς συντόνους ἁρμονίας, ἀλλὰ τὰς ἀνειμένας ἢ φύσις ὑποβάλλει τοῖς τηλικούτοις. διὸ καλῶς ἐπιτιμῶσι καὶ τοῦτο Σωκράτει τῶν περὶ τὴν μουσικὴν τινες, ὅτι τὰς ἀνειμένας ἁρμονίας ἀποδοκιμάσειεν εἰς τὴν παιδείαν ὡς μεθυστικὰς λαμβάνων αὐτὰς οὐ κατὰ τὴν τῆς μέθης δύναμιν, βακχευτικὸν γὰρ ἢ γε μέθη ποιεῖ μᾶλλον, ἀλλ' ἀπειρηκυίας. ὥστε καὶ πρὸς τὴν ἐσομένην ἡλικίαν τὴν τῶν πρεσβυτέρων δεῖ καὶ τῶν τοιούτων ἁρμονιῶν ἄπτεσθαι καὶ τῶν μελῶν τῶν τοιούτων· ἔτι δ' εἴ τίς ἐστι τοιαύτη τῶν ἁρμονιῶν ἢ πρέπει τῇ τῶν παίδων ἡλικίᾳ διὰ τὸ δύνασθαι κόσμον τ' ἔχειν ἅμα καὶ παιδιάν, οἷον ἢ λυδιστὶ φαίνεται πεπονηθέναι μάλιστα τῶν ἁρμονιῶν. δῆλον ὅτι τούτους ὅρους τρεῖς ποιητέον εἰς τὴν παιδείαν, τό τε μέσον καὶ τὸ δυνατόν καὶ τὸ πρέπον] [1342b 17—34].

That this passage is not the work of Aristotle has been strongly suspected for some time²³. The main difficulties are these. To begin with, it is here assumed that »singing« is an appropriate musical activity for older men. But Aristotle had explicitly stated that »singing and the playing of instruments« is appropriate only for the young: »what is fitting« (τὸ πρέπον) for older men is precisely the enjoyment of the performances of others (cf. 1342b17—23 with 1340b20—21, 31—39 and 1342a1—4). Nor had Aristotle given any indication that special provisions may have to be made for those who are »enfeebled with age«. In the second place, it is claimed that the young ought to learn the relaxed modes not only because of their utility in later life but because one of them — the »Lydian«, i. e. the »relaxed« Lydian — »promotes orderliness while affording

²³ SUSEMIHL-HICKS bracket the passage, and argue the case for its spuriousness at length; W. L. NEWMAN, *The Politics of Aristotle*, Oxford 1887, III ad loc. agrees.

amusement»²⁴, or because it contributes directly to the (moral) education of the young. It is reasonably certain that Aristotle did not share this view. Aristotle had made it abundantly clear that the Dorian mode is the mode best suited to the education of the young; and while it is true that he seems prepared to accept others as well, the very fact that he leaves the door open to such harmonies »as may be approved by those who are expert in philosophy and the education concerning music« (1342a30—32) shows that the use of other harmonies was not »approved«, or at any rate not contemplated, by Aristotle himself. Moreover, it seems quite unlikely that he would have approved the use of the relaxed Lydian harmony under any circumstances. According to Aristotle, the effect of the »relaxed« harmonies is to dispose its listeners *μαλακοτέρως τὴν διάνοιαν* (1340b2—3): what they promote is not »orderliness« but a cowardly softness or effeminacy of spirit. It seems probable that relaxed Lydian belongs with those »deviant« harmonies (1342a23—24; cf. 1290a19—29) which Aristotle appears to reserve for the entertainment — the »relaxation« (*ἄνεσις*: 1341b41) — of the non-citizen class of his best regime. In short, Aristotle seems to share precisely that view of the relaxed harmonies which is the Platonic view. When the author of the final paragraph of the *Politics* criticizes »Socrates« for rejecting the use of the relaxed modes in education on the grounds that they are »associated with drinking« (*μεθυστικάι*), he is in effect criticizing Aristotle himself²⁵.

What appears to have happened is that a reader of the *Politics* felt himself authorized to contribute a supplementary note concerning a matter which Aristotle had seemed to leave to the judgment of »those who are expert in philosophy and the education concerning music«. Of the identity of the interpolator little can be said, except that his evident misunderstanding of Aristotle's real position would appear to mark him as a Peripatetic of a later time. But the authorities he invokes — »some of those concerned with music« (*τῶν περὶ τὴν μουσικὴν τινες*) — can be identified, I think, with reasonable certainty. If the information preserved by the Pseudo-Plutarch is correct, the criticism of Plato's handling of the relaxed modes points directly to Aristoxenus. But there is much more in this passage which points beyond Aristoxenus, directly — and unmistakably — to the school of Damon. While Aristotle had spoken only in passing of what is »fitting« for different ages (1340b33. 1342b17), the interpolator makes *τὸ πρέπον* a principle of his analysis (1342b18, 33—34);

²⁴ Here (b31—32) the mss. have *διὰ τὸ δύνασθαι κόσμον τ' ἔχειν ἅμα καὶ παιδείαν*. I think *παιδείαν* must be read. The idea of »education«, as I will suggest, is already implicit in *κόσμον*; and Aristotle had made it clear that the music education of the young must combine an education to virtue with pleasure, play or amusement (1339b11—25; 1340b14—17; 25—31).

²⁵ Cf. Pol. 1340b2 *μαλακοτέρως* with Rep. 398e6—7 *μέθη . . . καὶ μαλακία καὶ ἀργία*; e9 *μαλακαί τε καὶ συμποτικάι τῶν ἁρμονιῶν*.

but τὸ πρέπον appears to have been a fundamental category of Damonian theory²⁶. The emphasis on the actual performance of music by the old is at least compatible with what is known of the teaching of Damon, and is perhaps reflected in Plato's prescriptions for a chorus of old men dedicated to Dionysus (Laws 665a ff.). At all events, a Damonian concern for the music education of old men is directly attested, as has been seen, by Aristides Quintilianus.

As regards the education of the young, it is clear that the interpolator recommends the use of the relaxed Lydian mode not by itself but in addition to the Dorian (which had just been recommended for this purpose by Aristotle)²⁷. When he explains that the relaxed Lydian is suitable for the young because it »promotes orderliness while affording amusement«, what is implied, I think, is a distinction between the »orderly« (κόσμιον) ethos of relaxed Lydian and the »manly« (ἀνδρεῖον) ethos of Dorian (cf. 1342b12—14): while Dorian music teaches the manly virtues, and in particular the virtue of courage (ἀνδρεία), Lydian music teaches the softer virtues — order, moderation, and (perhaps) justice. That this distinction is Damonian in origin is strongly suggested by Aristides' analysis of the harmonic exercises ascribed to Damon in terms of »male« and »female« notes, and by its appearance in close proximity to the name of Damon in Plato's discussion of music education (Rep. 399e10—11 βίου . . . κόσμιου τε καὶ ἀνδρείου; cf. Laws 802e). Further confirmation may perhaps be found in Proclus' interpretation of the brief and very obscure discussion of the Damonian view of metrical ethos which is given in Plato's *Republic* (400b—c = fr. 37 B9 DIELS-KRANZ). According to Proclus, Damon regarded the enoplon as having a »manly character« (ἀνδρικὸν ἦθος), and the dactyl as being »productive of orderliness and equanimity« (κοσμιότητος ποιητικὸν καὶ ὁμαλότητος); while »both, when mixed together in the right fashion, provide education in the true sense«²⁸. For Damon, it would seem, music education as a whole is an attempt to instill and to harmonize qualities which, while equally necessary from a social or political point of view, are necessarily and naturally opposed.

²⁶ Aristides tells us that μουσική was defined by »some« as τέχνη πρέποντος ἐν φωναῖς καὶ κινήσειν (De mus. 1, 4 [4, 21]); the inclusion of dance strongly suggests Damon (fr. 37B6 DIELS-KRANZ = Athenaeus 14, 628c). Cf. Plato Rep. 399a7; 400b1—4.

²⁷ This seems to be the point of μέσον in b34—a rather clumsy attempt to harmonize the interpolated passage with the discussion of the Dorian mode which immediately precedes it (cf. b14); and Dorian seems to be the intended reference of the καὶ in b28.

²⁸ In Remp. I 61, 5—14 KROLL. A similar distinction appears in Aristides' discussions of harmony and meter (De mus. 2, 14 [82, 1—2]; 2, 15 [82, 24—25, 83, 27]). Also of interest is Aristides' definition of the Damonian πρέπον as a »harmony« (συμφωνία) of noble or praiseworthy qualities (1, 4 [5, 12—13]). The reconstruction of Damon's »Areopagitica« by H. RYFFEL (Eukosmia, MH 4, 1947, 23—38) fails to recognize, I think, the precise meaning of κόσμος and related terms in Damonian theory, though rightly stressing the aristocratic or conservative tendency of Damon's thought as a whole.

The following remarks may serve by way of conclusion. There appears to have been an important disagreement between Damon and Aristoxenus on the one hand and Plato and Aristotle on the other regarding the nature of the relaxed harmonies, in particular the relaxed Lydian. This mode — invented, according to one account, by Damon himself — seems to have formed an integral part of music education as understood by the Damonian school. Its educational utility was recognized, though perhaps less fully, by Aristoxenus; it was denied by Plato and Aristotle. Plato seems (and it is necessary to stress the qualification) to have accepted the Damonian principle that different modes are required to promote the opposing virtues of courage and moderation, or that the Dorian mode by itself is not sufficient for the purposes of education. With Aristotle this principle is abandoned, and the Dorian mode is recognized — possibly in connection with the musical revolution of the fourth century, which made of the old Dorian mode the central of seven species of the octave — as a »mean« which promotes a »mean and settled« character (Pol. 1342b14—16. 1340b3—4), a character that is at once moderate and manly. As regards the notion of music education itself, I have tried to show that Damon restricted it to the young and the old. Only with Plato is musical *paideia* understood to encompass mature men as well as the young, the healing of the passions as well as the formation of character; and if some trace of the Damonian concern for the old or superannuated remains in the Platonic presentation, it disappears in the sober restatement (which in other respects is similarly comprehensive) of Plato's position by Aristotle.

University of Virginia

CARNES LORD

ZU EINEM ZITAT AUS DEM KANON DES POLYKLET

Χαλεπώτατον τὸ ἔργον, ὅταν εἰς ὄνυχά
ὁ πηλὸς ἀφίκηται

Von den beiden beglaubigten Fragmenten, die wir aus dem Kanon des Polyklet besitzen¹, hat das oben zitierte für den Archäologen ein doppeltes Interesse. Es spricht nicht nur (mehr als man bislang hat wahrhaben wollen) vom Grundanliegen des Werks, sondern es gibt auch an einem Punkt einen Einblick in die Arbeitsweise und Technik des Erzbildners Polyklet. Das Zitat

¹ Vgl. H. DIELS, Die Fragmente der Vorsokratiker (6. Aufl., herausgeg. v. W. KRANZ) I 40 B 1 und 2. Dazu kommt das von D. SCHULZ erkannte Zeugnis bei Plutarch, De recta rat. aud. 45 C—D, 13 (s. unten Anm. 8). Zur Diskussion über dieses wichtige Fragment und die zentralen Begriffe der *συμμετρία*, *ἁρμονία*, *εὐρυθμία* sowie über die Bedeutung